


POPULARIZING ECONOMICS. TRANSLATIONS,
ABRIDGMENTS, AND MINOR WORKS ON MORAL
ECONOMY (15TH-16TH CENTURIES)

*Popularización de la economía. Traducciones, resúmenes y
obras menores sobre economía moral (siglos XV-XVI)*

Giovanni CECCARELLI 
Università di Parma
giovannimarcello.ceccarelli@unipr.it

Fecha de recepción: 25/10/2021
Fecha de aceptación: 19/05/2022

ABSTRACT: This article explores pre-modern moral economy from an unconventional perspective. Instead of focusing on major thinkers and celebrated texts, it addresses lesser known sources and unoriginal authors, shifting the analysis from the production of economic ideas to their transmission and reception. Two specific domains are targeted. On the one side, an exemplary set of minor and unedited works made of short compositions, abridgments, and collations; on the other, texts deviating from academic canons by writing about moral economy in vernacular instead of Latin. These sources provide insights on how economic vocabularies and conceptualizations developed within the intellectual sphere, when coming into contact with a larger public, were reworked and adapted.

Keywords: moral economy; usury; reception; cultural translation.

RESUMEN: Este artículo explora la literatura económica bajomedieval y altomoderna desde una perspectiva no convencional. En lugar de centrarse en los pensadores más celebrados y los textos más conocidos,

aborda fuentes poco notas y autores sin originalidad, desplazando el análisis de la producción de ideas económicas a su transmisión y recepción. Se abordan dos ámbitos específicos. Por un lado, un conjunto ejemplar de textos menores e inéditos hecho por composiciones breves, compendios y colaciones; por otro, textos que se apartan de los cánones académicos al escribir de moral económica en lengua vernácula en lugar del latín. Estas fuentes permiten comprender cómo, al entrar en contacto con un público más amplio, los vocabularios y las conceptualizaciones económicas desarrolladas en los círculos intelectuales fueron reelaborados y adaptados.

Palabras clave: moral económica; usura; recepción y transmisión del pensamiento económico; traducción cultural.

1. NEW APPROACHES TO MORAL ECONOMY

Over the past decades there has been an increasing interest for scholastic writings on economic topics. Even a leading economist like Thomas Piketty (2020) now acknowledges that «la plupart des notions économiques que nous associons au capitalisme industriel et financier moderne trouvent en réalité leur origine dans des constructions intellectuelles développées dans l'Occident chrétien entre le XI^e et le XV^e siècle» (2017: 7).

For a long time, mainstream scholarship has interpreted these texts essentially in two ways. On the one side, an approach *à la* Jacques Le Goff (1960) was followed, as if these writings were an attempt to moralize the beginnings of commercial capitalism by ecclesiastical institutions that mistrusted any form of profit. On the other side, the point of reference was Joseph Schumpeter (1952), and therefore historians considered these texts as forerunners of a modern and scholarly oriented vision of economics.

Our understanding of the cultural framework in which late medieval and early modern economy flourished has however increased greatly, leading to the questioning of old interpretations and the emergence of new ones. Scholarly reconstructions are no longer conceived as surveys on ecclesiastical prohibitions on usury, nor as searches for economic concepts that can be labelled as «modern». Currently historians tend to see these writings as the effort to describe and codify what was occurring in everyday economy, combining conceptual categories matured within the Christian tradition with those inherited from the Greco-Roman culture, as well as innovating them.

Giacomo Todeschini (2001; 2002) has shown the lasting impact had on later Scholasticism by a centuries long strain of texts mostly conceived to guide the economic functioning of ecclesiastical institutions. The piling up of vocabularies,

metaphors, and concepts related to the economy and finance has heavily oriented what thinkers wrote between the 13th and the 16th century. This process is best exemplified referring to the numerous treatises on usury and the just price authored by Franciscans (Langholm, 1992: 345-373, 403-446). When writing on these topics, these friars used (and transplanted) words, ideas and categories developed to speak and regulate the vow of poverty of Saint Francis (Todeschini, 2004). Joel Kaye (1998; 2014), while confirming the substantial influence played by Aristotelian ideas on late-medieval discussions on the economy, showed a much richer textual tradition coming from Greco-Roman world. Innovative views on the 13th century's thriving European market society are ascribable to medieval medical commentaries on Galen's writings, at least as much as to those on Aristotle's *Ethics* and *Politics*. More recently, Francesca Trivellato (2019) has clarified how this literature was decisive in the framing of later economic structures, pointing particularly to the building of stereotypes on Jews. Her work puts the emphasis on the long lasting implications deriving from an economic language that was molded by late medieval scholasticism.

This substantial reassessment went along with the progressive broadening of the documentation taken in analysis. This made it possible to explore in depth the origin of the key concepts of late medieval discussions on economic matters and to better reconstruct their meaning. In the 1930s, Amintore Fanfani (1932) could be satisfied by reading Thomas Aquinas and a few other thinkers. Twenty years later, the field of study was revolutionized when Raymond de Roover (1957) dubbed Bernardino of Siena and Antonino of Florence as the «two great economic thinkers of the Middle Ages.» Yet, in the 1970s, scholars discovered that most of these «great economic thoughts» were extensively copied from the works of an obscure (at that time) Franciscan friar named Peter John Olivi (Todeschini, 1980; Kirshner, Lo Prete, 1984; Spicciani, 1976). Since then, the sources considered have significantly increased, and now scholars must consider a very broad array of genres and domains. Research can now include the economic metaphors extant in the Gospel (Todeschini, 2002: 13-28), as well as some *quaestiones disputatae* addressed by obscure theologians in mid-14th century Catalonia (Hernando Delgado 1990-1991); it can range from the study of Carolingian Capitularies to that of late 13th-century *quodlibets* (Toneatto, 2012; Ceccarelli, 2006); it can encompass juridical advises on the *Mons Pietatis*, as well as treatises of commercial arithmetic (Amadori, 2007; Ceccarelli, 2022); it can comprise the economic content of sermons expanding to the ideological framework that accounting records of Franciscan convents reveal (Evangelisti, 2020; Lenoble, 2013).

But the overall impression is that our knowledge is still partial. Among others, a case in point is provided by unedited handwritten sources. How many documents still unknown and not studied are in the libraries? And what kind of material is it? Is there maybe a new Olivi waiting to be found?

2. INCLUDING THE RECIPIENTS IN THE NARRATIVE

Holding on these recent trends in scholarship and taking advantage of the increased spectrum of sources, I suggest a broader shift in order to enlarge the field of analysis from the production of economic ideas to their transmission and reception. A change of approach capable to encompass not only those who constructed this economic language — and, by doing this, deeply innovated it — but also those who were their recipients and employers. To the extent allowed by the existing sources, the focus should go on those outside the intellectual sphere of the university, whose economic lives were however affected by these intellectual innovations. To do so, one needs to look beyond what scholasticism wrote and argued about usury or just price, to target the body of simplified and «popular» writings that made these views comprehensible to the clergy and a broader public. These sources reveal a wider perspective if addressed following an approach experimented by scholars of book history and cultural historians in seminal works such as those by Robert Darnton (1982) or by Lisa Jardine and Anthony Grafton (1990).

In this article I explore the potential of two specific categories of materials. On the one side, a substantial body of minor unedited writings made of short compositions, adaptations, and collations, which have so far been overlooked by scholars and still awaits careful analysis. On the other, those texts that have chosen not to discuss about economic topics in the language normally used in academic circles (i.e. Latin), but to embrace linguistic innovation and write in vernacular.

These are not, however, the only available sources to explore, at the crossroads of the late Middle Ages and early Modernity, this «middling» and «average» view of the economy and finance. Relevant parts of this narrative can also be found in written sermons, confession manuals, and even inquisition records.

A first and well known case is provided by preaching, being late medieval sermons the outcome of a strong interplay between the author and its audience (Muessig, 2002). Extant transcriptions by those who witnessed a preacher speaking to the public provide priceless information about the set of techniques adopted, including dramatic gestures, bonfire of the vanities, and theatrical machineries (Izbicki 1989: 211-234; Mayne Kienzle, 2002). An effective preacher was expected to bridge the distance with the recipients, as is well exemplified by the widespread use of vernacular instead of the learned Latin, to better convey preaching (Delcorno, 1995). In order to be on the same page with their audience, sermons were under a constant remodeling thanks to preparatory drafts, notebooks, and simplified compilations of major scholarly works that preachers carried with them from one city to another (Amadori, 2007: 41-48). The economic content of these sources was recently put under scrutiny suggesting variations between what a theologian orally preached and wrote on the same topic (Ughetti, 2020).

Manuals for confessors, which experienced a boom in the 14th century, are another example of the push toward a vulgarized and thus more conveyable literature on economic subjects. This literary genre changes over time, passing from being closely related to canon law, to serve as a practical tool of pastoral care and instruction of the clergy (Michaud-Quantin, 1962; Grossi, 1966; García y García et al., 1992). This transition often coincides with the attempt of rephrasing in a less elitist fashion canonical and theological doctrines developed within academic circles (Arquero Caballero, 2014/15). The *Summae* by John of Freiburg or Astesanus of Asti provide for instance an accessible reworking of Aquinas' or Duns Scotus' views on a number of subjects, including economic ones (Boyle, 1974: 245-268; Ceccarelli, 2001: 15-58). This choice reveals an adaptation process, visible since the late 13th century, to meet the demand coming from the larger audience that manuals for confessors targeted. Other writings, such as those by Monaldus of Capodistria and Bartolomeo of San Concordio, show the same effort, by organizing their internal structure through alphabetical entries that allow readers to easily access the topics they are interested in (Durissini, 1994: 217-258). Between the 15th and the 16th century, the alphabetical structure will become the rule, confirming the tendency of trivializing earlier scholastic thinking. Far from simply witnessing a lack of understanding of economics as Langholm argued (2003: 263-265), if properly handled, these sources have the great advantage of shedding light on the public they were conceived for.

A last, but less explored topic, concerns trials and public enquiries on usury. These become more frequent after the Councils of Lyons (1274) and Vienne (1311-1312) threatened to excommunicate or hit with ecclesiastical interdict any authority tolerating the presence of manifest usurers on their lands (Dorin, 2013). Sources related to the implementation of these ecclesiastical decrees can offer invaluable insights on how agents creatively reworked the official views of the Church (Dorin, 2014). An interesting example is provided by a trial, held in early 14th century Bologna, concerning two Florentines who claimed that lending at a yearly interest of 20% was not a sin. To clear themselves, the two cite the Digest revealing a defense strategy capable of exploiting the inconsistency between canon and civil law (Giansante, 2008: 9-10). This and the previous cases show how highly intellectualized ideas, when coming into contact with the larger audience, underwent adaptations and even bottom-up re-elaborations.

3. MINOR WORKS FROM THE VENETIAN REGION

The existing body of handwritten works by minor and often anonymous authors has been up to now essentially overlooked by most scholars, who were interested instead in studying thinkers who were capable of a high level of conceptualization. Nonetheless, extant copies of these seemingly unimportant texts are commonly to

be found in library collections. Exploring the potential of such materials, which often are not even mentioned by the catalogues, requires a preliminary survey of the available handwritten sources. This clearly implies to address specific samples that can provide evidence of a broader tendency.

In this article I have decided to focus on a case-study, namely the analysis of the 13th and 14th century manuscripts of a specific geographical area: the Venetian region. This is an interesting case, given that the main centers of this region — essentially Venice and Padua —, unlike other cities like Bononia, Paris, Florence and Genoa, are usually considered to be scarcely concerned with economic doctrine (Lane, 1966). Somehow revealing of this peripheral condition is the repeated reference to a native of Dubrovnik, Benedetto Cotrugli, when scholars comment on the Venetian contribution to moral economy (Tucci, 1990; Favero, 2017; Sangster, 2020). Nonetheless, several studies reveal that clerics and friars were not only attentive to the growing economic and financial dynamism of this area, but also had an important role in it (Rigon, 2002).

As it will be seen, this is clearly reflected by the documentation taken into analysis. The investigation is based on a survey carried out at the University Library of Padua, on almost 2,300 codices, which has allowed to detect more than 150 handwritten volumes containing works related to economic topics. This material can be considered as good sample of the entire region, since many of the codices are coming from convents and monasteries of other cities, which were suppressed during the Napoleonic period, including Venice, Udine, Feltre, Belluno (Humphreys, 1966; Meneghin, 1993; Pantarotto, 2003).

To better frame our understanding of minor works extant in these library collections, two preliminary issues should be mentioned. First, the survey unveiled the existence of an unedited text of some relevance, such as the *Summula contractuum*¹ written by the Observant friar Giovanni of Prato. This almost unknown treatise, which can be found in a significant number of copies in several Italian and European libraries, should be included with full rights among the sources of medieval economic thought.² In this work, which dates back to mid-15th century, Giovanni of Prato not only provides a brilliant and noteworthy synthesis of the so-called

1. Padua, University Library, 694, fols. 141r-172r.

2. Bologna, University Library, Lat. 1755; Bologna, University Library, Lat. 4218; Brussels, Royal Library, 2601 (II.2419); Florence, Laurenziana Library, Ashb. 145; Leiden, Public Library, 1812; London, Soane Museum Library, 10; Manchester, Rylands Library, Lat. 202; Mantova, Municipal Library, H.I.8; St. Bonaventure NY, University Library, 13; Olomouč, National Library, MI 184, fols. 209r-240v; Bibl. Oxford, Bodleiana Library, Canon. Script. Eccles. 22; Parma, Palatina Library, Parmense 1440; Pavia, University Library, Aldini 64; Terni, Municipal Library, 273.

«Franciscan school», but also proves to be original on a variety of economic topics (Bacchelli, 2001).

The second point concerns, the handwritten circulation of single works before the spreading of printed books. While manuscripts of Bernardino of Siena³ and Antonino of Florence⁴ prove to be as widespread as their later printed versions of 16th century books, for other reputed medieval thinkers the picture seems to be different. In the 15th century libraries of the Venetian region it was very rare to find texts of the leading theologians of the 13th-14th century, like Thomas Aquinas⁵, Albert the Great, John Duns Scotus, or Richard of Middleton⁶. On the contrary, all the major handbooks for confessors written in the same period — like those of Monaldus of Capodistria, John of Friburg and Bartolomeo of San Concordio — were kept in a number of copies.⁷ This confirms the argument stated above, namely that manuals for confessors greatly contributed to convey the ideas of major theologians. In doing this, however they acted as cultural brokers between these scholastic thinkers and a larger audience, adapting their message to the recipients of it.

Furthermore, works traditionally neglected by scholars seem to have had a broad circulation that, in many cases, went way beyond the libraries of the Venetian region and Northern Italy, spreading up to those of Northern Europe. The writings of two 15th century Observant friars perfectly fit this frame-work. On the one side, the *De usuris, de restitutionibus et de excommunicatione* written around 1440 by the Bolognese Francesco Piazza⁸ (Piana, 1982: 268-269); on the other, the two treatises *de contractibus* and *de restitutionibus*, dating approximately to 1480, by Angelo Carletti of Chivasso⁹ (Ceccarelli, 2012). These writings, are far more abundant than 20th-century scholarship recognized, proving that our understanding of late medieval and early modern discussions on finance and economy is biased. What publishers decided to print (or not to print) in the 16th century, when most of the «major» works found their way into print, had a substantial consequence.

3. Padua, University Library: 424, 475, 920, 944, 998, 1182, 1192, 1311, 1502, 1511, 1514, 1695, 2099, and 2105.

4. Padua, University Library: 424, 459, 474, 490, 564, 586, 637, 694, 736, 778, 944, 1076, 1133, 1288, 1318, 1373, 1511, 1502, 1576, 1786, 1818, 2036, 2037, 2097.

5. Padua, University Library: 936, 1124, 1442, 1456, 1457.

6. Padua, University Library: 685.

7. Padua, University Library: 607, 608, 618, 980, 1169, 1251, 1695, 2107, 2158, 2202.

8. Padua, University Library: 586, 735, 766, 773, 1159, 1182, 1182, 1518, 1549, 2142, 2205.

9. Padua, University Library: 586, 694, 1786.

4. ECONOMIC «ANTHOLOGIES» IN THE MAKING

When taking a closer look to the body of «minor» sources, a first element that should be emphasized is the existence of several manuscripts dealing exclusively with economic topics. Moreover, these codices tended to gather in the same volume a selection of different works devoted to one specific issue. The internal structure of these collections may vary with reference to their written content, but in general terms it seems to have followed a quite defined logic. The core is made up of major works — one or more treatises on contracts, usury and restitution, or a manual for confessors with a dense economic content. To this core part is added a series of *quaestiones* or short treatises on more specific subjects: buying on credit, partnerships for cattle breeding, money-changing, credit connected to land lease, to name some. Compilations as such are often completed by excerpts containing the economic sections of larger works (which are not included in the manuscript), or by alphabetical tables listing the *quaestiones* in which these latter were arranged¹⁰.

The structure of a manuscript of the third quarter of the 15th century coming from the Franciscan convent of San Francesco in Padua provides a case in point (Pantarotto, 2003: 112-113). It is made of three main texts: the treatise on contracts by Angelo of Chivasso¹¹, the *Confessionale*¹² by Antonino of Florence, in the version known as *Defecerunt*, integrated with a *De restitutionibus* by the same author, later perfected in his famous *Summa*¹³. These texts are interposed by two short treatises, the author of which is not specified (and to which I will come back later) that discuss a contract combining credit and land lease (*contractus livellarius*)¹⁴. The manuscript moreover includes: a collection of canon law cases attributed to Chiaro of Florence¹⁵, several *additiones* very likely written by Giovanni of Prato¹⁶, and a series of *dubia*¹⁷ concerning confession by Giovanni of Capestrano. The last part of the handwritten volume includes three texts that are not directly linked to economic matters, like the *De excommunicationibus* by Francesco Piazza¹⁸, the *De Ornatu et habitu mulierum* by Antonino of Florence¹⁹ and a legal advice — a *Consilium* — on Jewish food precepts²⁰ by the jurist Angelo de Castro.

10. Examples in Padua, University Library: 475, 586, 694, 1159, 1182, 1786.

11. Padua, University Library, 586, fols. 1r-32r.

12. Padua, University Library, 586, fols. 82r-153v.

13. Padua, University Library, 586, fols. 33r-58r.

14. Padua, University Library, 586, fols. 77r-77v.

15. Padua, University Library, 586, fols. 78r-81r.

16. Padua, University Library, 586, fols. 62v-68v.

17. Padua, University Library, 586, fols. 164r-171r.

18. Padua, University Library, 586, fols. 154r-163v.

19. Padua, University Library, 586, fols. 61r-62r.

20. Padua, University Library, 586, fols. 174r-176v.

The degree of selectivity these compilations reveal is at times extremely sophisticated, as shown by the case of four quodlibetal questions by Petrus de Trabibus that can be found in a manuscript from the second half of the 15th century. The choice made by the copyist, who decided to transcribe, among the eighty questions discussed by this Franciscan theologian at the end of the 13th century (Lambertini, 2020a: 267-276), only the four that address economic topics, is revealing of an active intervention²¹. The selection made when assembling this type of handwritten compilations suggests that, in the Late Middle Ages, topics with an economic background were perceived as sharing common traits (Considine, 2015). Copyists and readers, independently of the specific author discussing them and the literary genre adopted, felt these compositions as connected. A closer analysis of the manuscripts reveals agency in the use of these materials. Alongside the standard marginal notations written by the readers, there are also small details revealing that these texts were addressed in a manner far from being passive (Acheson, 2019: 8). It is not uncommon to find cross-references among different works transcribed in the same codex, clearly showing the conceptual link made by the reader (Ziegler, 2019). For example, in a manuscript coming from the Observant convent of Feltre there is an extant copy of an unauthored short *quaestio* on buying and selling on credit. Besides transcribing this anonymous composition, the copyist also felt the need to insert three marginalia to make a cross-reference to the section of the codex where he copied the treatise on contracts by Angelo of Chivasso²². But manuscripts might also contain diagrams drawn by copyists or readers in order to clarify the content of economic writings (Acheson, 2013: 51-88). A good example is provided by a graph summarizing the complex variety of contracts addressed by Bernardino of Siena in his treatise *De contractibus*²³.

By analyzing in more detail how these volumes are arranged, we also see the tendency to assemble in a single sequence writings concerning a specific subject. In this way, something similar to a «thematic collection» took shape, with the gathering of different genres and authors in the same part of a codex. Under some respects, these collections represent an alternative to the standard treatises, where a single thinker carried out a systematic analysis on several topics. Once again, the impression one gets is that recipients of economic texts approached the matter in a way that did not coincided with well-established literary rules. These «anthologies» confirm the degree of awareness achieved by those in charge of transcribing the texts, from one manuscript to the other.

21. Padua, University Library, 694, fols. 139r-140v; cp. Florence, National Library, Conv. Sopp. D.6.359, fols. 112rb-va.

22. Padua, University Library, 1786, fol. 344r.

23. Padua, University Library, 1182, fol. 138r.

As several incunabula editions suggest, their impact went well beyond the circulation the original handwritten versions granted. As a matter of fact, it is not uncommon to see manuscript «anthologies» reproduced with minor or no changes in late 15th printed materials. One of the best known examples is provided by the collections on the *Mons pietatis* that, not by chance, was published in Venice by Giovanni da Tridino²⁴. It essentially reproduced the writings that Franciscan preachers like Bernardino of Feltre gathered to support this new charitable institution during their sermons (Muzzarelli, 2000; Melchiorre, 2012; Lambertini 2020b). Another interesting example coming from the Venetian region is provided by the *Summa* by Bartolomeo of San Concordio. Not only it includes the enlargement (the *Supplementum*) to the original handbook completed by Nicholas of Osimo in mid-15th century, but it also comprises two other minor works. While the first one, written by Astesanus of Asti, is extremely short and mostly concerned with penitential procedure, the second one focuses on credit, being made of a series of juridical advices on Jewish pawn-broking in Padua²⁵. The author of these legal *consilia* is Alessandro da Nevo, a civil law professor from Vicenza, who taught at the local University (Murano, 2016). Given the reputation this latter had in the region, it seems no coincidence that, of the ten extant early editions that are organized according to the above mentioned structure, printed between 1476 and 1485, eight are published in Venice²⁶.

5. A REGIONAL VIEW ON MORAL ECONOMY?

Handwritten thematic collections also make it possible to shed light on the ongoing trends in economic writings in the Venetian region, as well as at a broader geographical level. These anthologies provide insights on the prevailing genres used

24. *Pro Monte Pietatis. Consilia sacrorum Theologorum ac collegiorum Patavii et Perusii. Clarissimorumque doctorum dd. Ioannis Baptistae Rozelli et Ioannis Campegi. Cum bulla ac brevi dato fratri Bernardino Feltrensi Sacratissimi Pape Innocentii Octavi*, Venice, Johannes Tacuinus de Tridino, between 1494-1498. The book assembles nine different compositions of different genre and length.

25. I make reference to the first edition, namely Nicolaus de Ausimo, *Supplementum Summae Pisanellae*, Venice: Franciscus Renner, 1476. Bartolomeo's *Summa* with the enlargements by Nicholas of Osimo are at fols. 1r-317v, followed by a table of content, at fols. 318r-331v. The *Canones poenitentiales* by Astesanus are at fols. 331v-334v and the five *Consilia* by Alessandro da Nevo at fols. 335r-355v.

26. Four editions are printed by Franciscus Renner (1476, 1477, 1482, and 1483), the others by Leonard Wild (1479), by Andrea Torresano, Bartolomaeo de Blavis, and Maffeo de Paterbonis (1481), by Giorgio Arrivabene and Paganino de Paganini (1485), and a last one was printed in 1479/80 without the publisher's name. The only two non-Venetian editions are printed in Milano (1479) and Vercelli (1485).

to address such topics, as well as on the issues that routinely concerned the local clergy. Focusing on these sources, it is possible to detect what types of response to these issues was given, not by academics teaching theology in some major European university, but from theologians and canonists who operated in the region.

A first thematic area revolves around partnerships for cattle breeding or agistment, as it was technically called. The guiding reference on the topic appears to be the treatise by Angelo Perigli, a jurist from Perugia. This work, which also discusses commercial partnerships and will be published in the *Tractatus Universi Iuris* in the 1580s²⁷, is extant in five copies²⁸. There are codices where the *Tractatus de societatibus* of Perigli is transcribed together with other compositions on the same subject, including a peculiar series of canon law cases (*declarationes*)²⁹ ascribed to Clarus of Florence. This latter assembly is extant in another manuscript, originally kept in the Observant convent of Feltre, where another selection of *casus* on agistment, inspired by (yet not identical to) the treatise *De contractibus* by Bernardino of Siena, is also transcribed³⁰.

A different body of writings, which is less relevant for the subject I address here, focuses on the display of female luxuries and other sumptuary issues. This topic will be organically addressed by Antonino of Florence in the treatise *De ornatu mulierum* (Izbicki, 2004: 142-161). The success of Antonino's text is confirmed by the large number of handwritten copies extant in the Venetian region³¹. As usual, this major work is often transcribed together with other 15th century writings giving birth to an anthology on this subject. A good example is provided by the official reply given on this matter by Pope Eugene IV³² to the theologian Francesco Piazza (Henquinet, 1939: 13), as well as by a letter of Ludovico Barbo, the Bishop of Treviso³³, on the topic of female hairstyles. Other codices assemble together less successful works on this subject, including a short treatise by Giovanni of Capestrano³⁴, and several minor (often anonymous) compositions, written in Padua³⁵.

A further topic that comes up frequently among these handwritten sources of the Venetian region is that of sales on credit. The most interesting work, though

27. Angelus de Periglis, de Perusio, *De societatibus*, in *Tractatus universi iuris*, vol. VI-1, Venetiis: Franciscus Ziletti, 1584, fols. 130vb-132vb.

28. Padua, University Library: 424, 474, 1288, 1520, 2029.

29. Padua, University Library, 1288, fols. 147vb-148rb.

30. Padua, University Library, 723. fols. 14v; 35r-46v and 24r-28r.

31. Padua, University Library: 454, 586, 1159, 1288, 1504, 1518, 1576, 1695, 2029.

32. Padua, University Library, 1159, 185r-186r.

33. Padua, University Library, 1288, 114r-114v.

34. Padua, University Library, 773, fols. 91r-128v.

35. Padua, University Library: 723, 773, 1035, 1887.

anonymous, is extant in four different codices³⁶ coming from the Observant convents of Feltre (Santo Spirito) and Padua (San Francesco). It has also been transcribed in several other manuscripts and circulated outside the Venetian region. A first one, originally from Curtatone in Lombardy, is now among the University of Chicago's³⁷ holdings; a second one is in the Ambrosiana Library³⁸ of Milan (Izbicki, 1983); the last codex is currently in the Czech Republic³⁹, but was earlier kept in a Franciscan convent of Basel (Boháček, 1994: 110-111). It is written in form of a *quaestio*, a genre that became fashionable after Thomas Aquinas used it to address the topic of buying and selling on credit (Capitani, 1958). The unknown author explicitly states to aim at offering a simplified summary of the most famous opinions on the matter. In the beginning, if we except Thomas Aquinas, only Franciscan theologians are mentioned as authorities, including: Alexander of Alexandria, Duns Scotus, Richard of Middleton, Landolfo Caraccioli, Bernardino of Siena, and Francesco Piazza.⁴⁰ The composition is datable around mid-15th century, thanks to the reference to Piazza, who was active in the 1440s (Todeschini, 2002: 184), and the possession note in one of the manuscripts, making reference to the year 1462.⁴¹

In the body of the first composition, the promise of making accessible to a larger public a broader tradition of writings is abundantly fulfilled. Giovanni of Capestrano and Francesco Piazza are mentioned but used indirectly, while the main sources are Alexander of Alexandria and John Duns Scotus, at times summarized and at times copied verbatim. Nonetheless there are also parts of the composition revealing that the author is capable of independence thought. It is therefore a text summarizing the standard Franciscan views on the credit sales but, at the same time, there is an attempt of updating them with personal views. A marked character in addressing the matter leaves no doubt about the fact that the author was a Franciscan friar, likely active in the Venetian region, as business terms locally adopted suggest.

The trend of summarizing the most important works, writing compendia that condense in few pages the previous tradition on a given economic topic, seems to be a distinctive feature of this period. It is not an isolated case, since another short *quaestio* on credit sales⁴² beginning with a very a similar statement, is extant in

36. Padua, University Library: 586, fols. 186r-187v; 694, fols. 183r-184v; 736, fols. 67r-70v; 1159, fols. 172r-175v.

37. Chicago, University Library, ms. 689, fols. 56v-60r.

38. Milan, Ambrosiana Library, ms. E 73 sup., fols. 64va-67rb.

39. Olomouc, Research Library, M I 184, fols. 184r-188r.

40. Padua, University Library: 586, fol. 186r: «Qualiter potest uendi ad credentiam ex dictis Alexandri de Alexandria [Duns] Scoti Landulphi [Caraccioli] Thome [Aquini] Ricardi [de Mediavilla] Santi Bernardini et Francisci de Platea.»

41. Padua, University Library, 736, fol. 117r.

42. Padua, University Library, 1786, fol. 344.

another manuscript; in this case the anonymous author only refers to Giovanni of Capestrano, Francesco Piazza, and Alexander of Alessandria.

Coming to the fourth theme, namely money-changing, these handwritten compilations provide a glimpse of what appears to have been a vivid debate in 15th-century Venice. The main character of the dispute was Francesco Pola, a Venetian civil lawyer; from his writings we learn that he was asked by some aristocrats and merchants of the city to give a legal advice, a *consilium*, on this matter⁴³. Thanks to Reinhold Mueller (1997: 340-345), we know in detail the contents of this debate, as well as those who took part to it. The main opponent of Francesco Pola, was a Dominican theologian, named Leonardo Mattei, whose work did not emerge in my survey, but is extant in a codex of the Vatican Library (Visnjevac, 2018)⁴⁴. It is worthwhile noticing that even in this case the recurring pattern of combining local contributions with major works, typical of these collections, returns once more. It is clearly not by chance that in the manuscripts containing Pola's legal advice, his *consilium* is transcribed together with excerpts devoted to money-changing from the treatise on contracts of Bernardino of Siena and from the *Summa* of Antonino of Florence⁴⁵. Another element to underline regards the fact that abridged versions of Pola's *consilium* circulated as well; one of them can be found in a manuscript coming from a convent of Udine, the city where Leonardo Mattei was active⁴⁶.

It is when addressing credit contracts related to land property that thematic compilations reveal how complex these collections could become. The survey has allowed to detect five distinct codices, all extant in Padua⁴⁷, that contain a sequence of works, all different if one looks at their genre and their authorship, targeted at discussing this very specific form of credit, called the *contractus livellarius* (Corazzol, 1979). They concerned what was the Venetian variant of a widespread class of agreements that essentially resulted from a sale, combined with the usufruct or a long rent of a parcel of land. The owner could sell this parcel for a given amount of money, to then lease back its usufruct (*ad livellum*), paying in return an annual sum to the new holder. In a nutshell, these agreements allowed to acquire a flat sum of money while paying it back over a long period of time. Nonetheless, their connection (even when extremely feeble) with land property made them appear as something different from a loan on interest (Veraja, 1960: 5-26; Munro, 2003).

The Venetian collection can be schematically subdivided into four subsections, not always assembled in the same way. The first one is made of a short treatise on contracts⁴⁸, with the following incipit *Circa materiam contractuum*; the treatise is

43. Treviso, Municipal Library, 439.

44. Vatican Library, Chigi B.V.86.

45. Padua, University Library, 1502, fols. 156r-171r.

46. Padua, University Library, 1288, fols. 155v-156r.

47. Padua, University Library: 586, 694, 1159, 1182, 1786.

48. For example, Padua, University Library, 694, fols. 172r-180r.

divided into three articles: a theoretical part (*de contractum quidditate*), a central part, in which contracts are classified (*de contractuum varietate*), and a final part where their moral lawfulness is addressed (*de contractuum vitiositate*). In the second one, another treatise⁴⁹ is transcribed, whose incipit is *Circa materiam livellorum*. This work, in turn, is made of three parts, each of which could originally have been a separate composition: one discussion on the *contractus livellarius*, one on commerce, and a last one on just price. The third subsection contains the only work whose authorship is clear: it is a legal advice given by the already mentioned Alessandro da Nevo⁵⁰; the time bracket in which this *consilium* was given is between 1459 and 1471, though very likely it dates to the later years of the bracket. The collection is completed by a *distinctio* on the topic of just price in land lease and *contractus livellarius*, which sometimes was copied separately from the other subsections. This last composition is clearly derived from a renowned text on credit contracts and land sales, written by the most celebrated lawyer in the Venetian region, namely Bartolomeo Cepolla (Muzzarelli, 2000: 145-153)⁵¹.

Notwithstanding this clear local imprint, this assembly of texts was transcribed in manuscripts that circulated well beyond the area of Venice, and that now are among the holdings of American, Dutch and Czech libraries⁵². A systematic study of all the existing manuscripts should allow to fully reconstruct how this complex collection, made up of short treatises, *distinctions*, and *consilia*, took shape. This is a task that goes beyond the goal of this article, but some preliminary observations are however possible. The core of the collection is made of texts coming from the area of Padua, later enjoying a broader circulation in the direction of Lombardy (Mantova, Milano) and German speaking regions (Basel, Olomouc). The codices are all coming from libraries of Observant convents, a feature providing more than one clue to identify the possible authors or collectors of these texts. Many elements suggest that the person who, in one way or another, gathered these works is Niccolò Grassetti of Padua, a canon lawyer who joined in the Observance around mid-15th century (Amadori, 2007: 124-127). It would be however improper to ascribe all the anonymous works forming this anthology to this Franciscan canonist. Nonetheless, it is clear that it was Grassetti who inspired the compilation, not only assembling

49. For example, Padua, University Library, 586, fols. 77r-77v and 1182, fols. 105ra-106vb.

50. For example, Padua, University Library, 694, fols. 185v-194r and 1159, fols. 177v-178r. ms.

51. For example, Padua, University Library, 694, fols. 194r-200r and 1786, fols. 240r-244v. Cp. Bartholomaeus Caepolla, *Tractatus de contractibus emptionum et locationum cum pacto de retrovendendo simulatis*, in *Tractatus universi iuris*, vol. VII, Venetiis: Franciscus Ziletti, 1584, fols. 2r-15r.

52. Chicago, University Library, ms. 689; Leiden, Public Library, 1812; Olomouc, Research Library, M I 184.

together different texts on this subject, but also being able to involve in the discussion the most prominent jurists of the area. It was in fact him to ask for the legal advice of Alessandro da Nevo, which is included in the collection, as we can learn from the *incipit* of two extant copies⁵³ of this *consilium*.

Along with other unedited and never studied works (that go beyond the aim of this article), this latter compilation is a striking example of an existing Venetian literature related to economic topics. These texts, often dubbed as minor, partially dismiss the *cliché* that considers this area as a cultural environment scarcely interested in economic doctrine. In Padua and Venice locally confined debates tend to develop just like they did in Florence (Caferro, 2020; Armstrong, 1999), Genoa (Kirshner, 1977), Barcelona (Hernando Delgado, 1989), and Valencia (Puchades i Battaller, 1999), suggesting that this tendency was common to most European cities. Interestingly, these Venetian discussions develop in ways that most scholars, mainly focused on the issue of authorship and originality of content, have largely deemed as irrelevant. Much the contrary, these minor works and anonymous assemblages are invaluable sources, since they can shed light on the recipients of this literature.

6. THE VERNACULAR «BOOM» IN THE 16TH-CENTURY

In this perspective, another field of investigation that can provide precious information concerns a body of works that clearly diverge from the mainstream approach to economic topics. I refer to those sources that, instead of using the linguistic medium traditionally adopted in academic circles, namely Latin, embrace vernacular. These writings can provide invaluable evidence on how economic concepts, initially developed by within academic circles, could be popularized and made comprehensible to the lower clergy and the larger public.

As cultural translation studies show, the shift in language from Latin to the vernacular is an act of cultural brokerage and active appropriation, in which adaptation to the public on many levels was a major concern (Burke, 2007). The production and circulation of vernacular texts resulted from complex collaborative dynamics, involving authors, copyists, translators, readers, printers, and booksellers (Newman, Tylus, 2015: 2; Coolahan 2020: 1). Therefore, these sources can provide a perspective on a reading culture in which recipients are not passive, but become «makers of meaning» as noted by Peter Burke (2015: 25).

The 16th century promises to be a particularly fitting ground for this investigation. Clearly, economic texts in vernacular appear earlier, becoming increasingly common over the 14th and 15th centuries. A well-known case is provided by Francesc

53. Chicago, University Library, ms. 689, fol. 74r; Olomouc, Research Library, M I 184, fol. 194r.

Eixemenis, a Franciscan theologian who wrote several texts addressing economic matters in Catalan, including a *Tractat d'usura* and a *Regiment de la Cosa Publica* (Hernando Delgado, 2015: 244-266). But it is only later that both translations and original works in vernacular massively rise in number, partly because of a booming printing industry, partly because of a growing political use of vernacular languages connected to state-building, and partly because of intensifying religious rivalries (Burke, 2015: 16; Bauer and Marroquin Arredondo, 2019; Patton, 2019). The 16th century has often been characterized as a transitional period, and the rapid growth of vernacular learning and the emergence of a linguistically polycentric culture most certainly contributed to the scale of this transition.

As cultural translation studies stress, the departure from Latin generated a spectrum of incredibly rich sources, but in the economic sphere these have been virtually neglected. But the 16th century sources reveal a picture that is markedly different, with a number of examples concerning many different European languages in which economic texts were written, including Italian, Castilian, French, English, and Portuguese. A good example is provided by the translation from Latin to modern English, made by John Man, of the writings on usury⁵⁴ by Wolfgang Musculus, a Reformed theologian, that were published in London in 1563.

An expanding body of electronic resources and digitized book collections, together with a substantial printed literature and bibliographic repertories can open the way to surveys aimed at measuring the extent to which vernacular texts and translations on economic subjects spread during this period.

If properly handled, these resources can clarify several important questions. How often are vernacular texts chosen to tackle economic subjects? Are translations more popular than the original Latin writings on which they are based, or is this not the case? Is it possible to detect specific trends in publishing, reading, and thinking on economic questions on a geographical or chronological basis? Is the history similar for all European vernacular languages? Are there genres more commonly translated than others?

In this essay I explore the potential of a quantitative approach as such, by referring to a specific case, namely the book holdings of convents and monasteries in late 16th-century Italy. To do so I take advantage of the RICI (*Le Biblioteche Ordini Regolari in Italia a fine XVI secolo*) databank that was built using the entries of the surveys carried out by the Sacred Congregation of the Index (Borraccini, Granata and Rusconi, 2013).

While similar databases like the Incunabula Short Title Catalogue and Edit 16 (*Censimento nazionale delle edizioni italiane del XVI secolo*) are unrivaled regarding

54. Wolfgang Musculus, *Of Usurye in Common places of Christian religion . . .*, London, Reginald Wolfe, 1563, fols. 579r-587v.

the number of editions printed in the late 15th and during the 16th centuries, they offer little information on how many copies of a given title were available to the readers. Though limited to the niche readership of Italian monks and clerics, RICI allows to bypass this bottleneck, since it does not only provide a list of the editions of a given title, but it offers an estimated picture of which titles and editions circulated more than others.

The astonishing amount of entries the dataset offers requires to adapt the working sample of this investigation to a narrow definition of what to consider as economic texts. I therefore selected only works mentioning in their title very specific subjects, including usury, contracts, partnerships, *contractus livellarius*, money-changing, while I have not included more general ones. This should avoid the risk of statistical biases, over-representing the share that economic-related literature had in Italian 16th century convents and monasteries. Most handbooks for confessors, collections of sermons, or theological *Summae*, are thus not taken into consideration, as well as manuscripts and other handwritten materials, which are listed in the RICI database.

7. THE VERNACULARIZATION OF MORAL ECONOMY

Notwithstanding this narrowly delimited sample, the number of volumes listed in the database is impressive, totaling more than 1 800 copies. These correspond to almost 180 editions of books and 20 manuscripts addressing economic topics, which in the vast majority of cases were written in Latin. However, the share of vernacular works is not at all irrelevant as the results show (see Table 1). Slightly more than 15 per cent of the editions held by the libraries of convents and monasteries were written in Italian, as well as in Castilian, by authors ranging from Mauro Antonio Berarducci to Tomás de Mercado, from Serafino Razzi to Tommaso Buoninsegni. The share greatly increases if one considers the number of copies corresponding to these editions, totaling 35 percent of the overall books touching economic subjects.

Going more in detail it is possible to trace a first distinction between editions that were directly written in vernacular and titles that are a translation. The latter category has the larger share, with 19 editions, representing more than two thirds of the total editions, while only 10 fall in the former group. In terms of copies however, the overwhelming majority of texts, 543 out of 631, is made of translations from Castilian to Italian. Among the books directly written in vernacular the greatest share is in Italian, five editions for a total of 82 listed copies; however, the presence of 5 editions in Castilian is far from being marginal, although corresponding to only 6 copies among the library holdings.

TABLE 1: Vernacular texts on economic subjects in late16th century
Italian convents and monasteries

Author	Title	Year of print	Printer	Place of print	Language	Type	Copies
Bartolomé de Albornoz	Arte de los contractos	1573	Pedro de Huete	Valencia	Castilian	original	1
Martín de Azpilcueta	Trattato d'usure	-	Stamperia del Popolo Romano	Rome	Italian	translation	1
Martín de Azpilcueta	Comentarii resolutorii dell'usure, de' cambii, della simonia, della offesa del prossimo et del furto notabile. Trad. Niccolò da Guglionesi, F. Turchi	1556	-	-	Italian	translation	1
Martín de Azpilcueta	Manuale de' confessori et penitenti. Trad. Niccolò da Guglionesi	1569	Gabriele Giolito De Ferrari	Venice	Italian	translation	44
Martín de Azpilcueta	Manuale de' confessori. Con cinque commentarii, cioe de' cambi, dell'usure, della simonia, della difesa del prossimo, del furto notabile, & una questione della irregolarita. Cur. F. Turchi & Trad. Niccolò da Guglionesi	1575	Gabriele Giolito De Ferrari	Venice	Italian	translation	28
Martín de Azpilcueta	Commentario delle usure	1583	-	Milan	Italian	translation	1
Martín de Azpilcueta	Manuale de' confessori. Trad. Niccolò da Guglionesi	1583	Giovanni Giolito De Ferrari	Venice	Italian	translation	12
Martín de Azpilcueta	Manuale de' confessori, et penitenti. Trad. Niccolò da Guglionesi, G.M. Tarsia	1584	Andrea Muschio	Venice	Italian	translation	57
Martín de Azpilcueta	Compendio del manuale del Navarro. Cur. P. Calanna. Il compendio delle usure e de' cambij, fatto da Girolamo Giovannini	1592	Bernardo Basa	Venice	Italian	translation	127

POPULARIZING ECONOMICS. TRANSLATIONS, ABRIDGMENTS, AND MINOR WORKS
ON MORAL ECONOMY (15TH-16TH CENTURIES)
GIOVANNI CECCARELLI

Author	Title	Year of print	Printer	Place of print	Language	Type	Copies
Martín de Azpilcueta	Manuale de' confessori et penitenti. Trad. C. Camilli. Commentario delle usure et de i cambi	1592	Giorgio Angelieri	Venice	Italian	translation	71
Martín de Azpilcueta	Manuale del Navarro. Cur. P. Alagona Trad. C. Camilli. Compendio del trattato delle usure. Commentario de silentio	1594	Girolamo Franzini	Venice	Italian	translation	9
Martín de Azpilcueta	Compendio del Manuale. Cur. P. Calanna. Compendio del Trattato dell'usure et de' cambi	1599	Bernardo Basa	Venice	Italian	translation	22
Martín de Azpilcueta	Compendio del Manuale. Cur. P. Calanna. Compendio del Trattato dell'usure e dei cambi	1595	Bernardo Basa	Venice	Italian	translation	99
Mauro Antonio Berarducci	Trattato circa li cambi mercantili, cavato dalla Somma corona de' confessori	1584	Orazio Salviani	Naples	Italian	original	17
Tommaso Buoninsegni	De i cambi	1573	Giorgio Marescotti	Florence	Italian	original	3
Francisco de Borja [but Francisco Garcia]	Tractato de tutti li contratti e commezzij humani sogliono hoccorre	-	Pietro Maria Marchetti	Brescia	Italian	translation	1
Francisco Garcia	Trattato de' contratti in lingua spagnola	1583	Juan Navarro	Valencia	Castilian	original	2
Francisco Garcia	Trattato di tutti i contratti	1589	Pietro Maria Marchetti	Brescia	Italian	translation	35
Francisco Garcia	Trattato di tutti i contratti che nei negotii et commertii humani sogliono occorrere	1596	Pietro Maria Marchetti	Brescia	Italian	translation	8
Francisco Garcia	Trattato de tutti li contratti	1599	Pietro Maria Marchetti	Brescia	Italian	translation	1
Tomás de Mercado	Summa de tratos y contratos	1571	Fernando Diaz	Seville	Castilian	original	1
Tomás de Mercado	Sopra tratti et contratti	1583	Fernando Diaz	Seville	Castilian	original	1

Author	Title	Year of print	Printer	Place of print	Language	Type	Copies
Tomás de Mercado	Summa de tratos y contratos	1587	Fernando Diaz	Seville	Castilian	original	1
Tomás de Mercado	Trattato de' negotii, et contratti de mercanti, et de negotianti	1591	Pietro Maria Marchetti	Brescia	Italian	translation	14
Serafino Razzi	Cento casi di coscienza con la giunta d'alcuni casi de' cambii et un trattato de' censi	1586	Ventura Salvador	Venice	Italian	original	50
Luis Saravia de la Calle	Institutione de' mercanti che tratta del comprare et vendere, et della usura che puo occorrere nella mercantia insieme con un trattato de' cambi	1561	Bolognino Zaltieri	Venice	Italian	translation	11
Alfonso de Ulloa	De' cambi	-	-	-	Italian	translation	1
Antonio Maria Venusti	Compendio utilissimo di quelle cose, le quali a nobili e christiani mercanti appartengono	1561	Giovanni Antonio degli Antoni	Milan	Italian	original	11
Cristoforo Zabata	Dialogo de' cambi	1573	Cristoforo Bellone	Genoa	Italian	original	1

Source: *Le Biblioteche Ordini Regolari in Italia a fine XVI secolo* (RICI)

The survey shows that 16th century translations are not simply a matter of converting Latin into a modern language; among the economic works written in vernacular, some are translated into other vernacular languages, while others are rendered into Latin. Two famous Spanish works exemplify this complex interplay. The first is the *Treatise on contracts* by the Dominican Francisco Garcia that was originally written and published in Castilian, but shortly after translated in Italian. In the database entries we find both the original edition, printed in Valencia, and the translation, extant in two different reprints by the same publisher, Pietro Maria Marchetti⁵⁵. In terms of copies, this treatise covers more than 7 percent of the overall sample, with 47 references to library holdings distributed all over Italy.

55. Francisco Garcia, *Tratado utilissimo y muy general de todos los contractos quantos en los negocios humanos se suelen ofrecer*, Valencia, Joan Navarro, 1583; Francisco Garcia, *Trattato di tutti i contratti che nei negotii, et commertii humani sogliono occorrere*, Brescia, Pietro Maria Marchetti, 1589 and 1596. The RICI database also includes two inaccurate registrations

The second is provided by Martín Azpilcueta who in the 1550s published in Portuguese and in Castilian an extremely influential *Manual de confesores y penitentes*, which contained a commentary on usury and money-changing. This book was not only reprinted in Latin twenty years later, but enjoyed various translations in Italian that are extensively included in the RICI database.⁵⁶ The number of references to this work, either in its original full version or in the abridgment made by Paolo Cavanna with 221 and 248 copies respectively, has by far the largest share of the sample, proving how influential it was.

It might be useful to give an example that is reversed if compared to the previous ones, namely the translation of economic writings into Castilian. A case in point is provided by the above mentioned *Confessionale Defecerunt* by Antonino of Florence, an «all-time best sellers of the genre» with an extremely dense economic content if compared to the other versions the theologian wrote (Langholm, 2003: 133). The *Confessionale* is extant in hundreds of manuscripts versions and over seventy incunabula, of which one out of six is in vernacular⁵⁷. An edition dating 1499 is particularly relevant since the printer, Friedrich Biel, decided to add to the confessional the translation of the *De restitutionibus*, one of Antonino's most important economic works. Not by chance Biel was active in Burgos, at that time the main financial center of the Kingdom of Castile with extremely strong connections with Florence and its businesses (Dini, 1995; Ammannati, 2014; Casado Alonso, 2017).

The overall impression is that the printer targeted a specific public: an audience unable to read Latin or at least more at ease with Castilian, who was looking for abridged teachings on the confession, with particular reference to the economic side of it. This aim becomes clear if one looks at the first few lines introducing the translation where a clear reference to lay and uneducated readers is made. To reduce the difficulties of this type of public, Biel decides to depart from the original by expunging any legal reference from the translation. A choice as such does not appear to be an isolated case, given that other Castilian versions of Antonino's

by those in charge of drawing them: one does not specify the date of publication, the other clearly miswrote 1599 instead of 1589. The same Italian printer in 1579 published as well a Latin translation of Garcia's work, cp. Franciscus Garzia, *Tractatus De contractibus*. Brixiae, apud Petrum Marinum Marchettum, 1579.

56. Martín de Azpilcueta, *Manual de confesores y penitentes o Enchiridion confessoriorum*, Coimbra, João Barreira, João Álvarez, 1549; Martín de Azpilcueta, *Manual de confesores y penitentes*, Salamanca, Andrea de Portonariis, 1556; Martín de Azpilcueta, *Enchiridion, sive Manuale confessoriorum et poenitentium*, Rome, Victorium Romanum, 1573; Martín de Azpilcueta, *Manuale de confessori et penitenti*, Napoli, Raimondo Amato, 1567.

57. ISSC lists 73 editions, being the first published in Cologne in 1468; the first translation in Italian and Spanish were printed in 1492, respectively in Florence and Seville.

works do the same⁵⁸. This is a further sign that, when it came to economic topics, the use of vernacular tended to favor simplified versions, with clear implications on the readership.

Looking more closely at some of these vernacular works, we discover that translations implied selection and reassembly of Latin texts, originating something that is surprisingly similar to the handwritten «thematic collections» earlier taken into analysis. A good example is provided by the *Cento casi di coscienza con aggiunta d'alcuni casi de' cambii et un trattato de' censi*⁵⁹ assembled and translated from Latin by the Dominican friar Serafino Razzi.

A change of language frequently implied significant deviations from the original, including insertions and commentaries by the translator. Abridged versions were also extremely common, making the watershed between translation and adaptation extremely feeble. A case in point concerns Azpilcueta's writings, which are mostly printed in form of a summary, as the *Compendio delle usure e de' cambi* made by Girolamo Giovannini⁶⁰, another Dominican friar, clearly shows (Ridolfi, 2001). A further example, not referring to the RICCI database, is provided by *La Petite Dyablerie*⁶¹ a French version of a sermon where Bernardino of Siena discusses risk and economic activity, heavily reworked while translated by Noël Bédard and Thomas Varnet (Farge, 2008: 149).

Elsewhere, authors rewrote in vernacular their own Latin compositions; yet, in doing so, they often finished making an adaptation of their original work rather than translating it. At times, vernacular was the opportunity for lesser-known writers to freely cut and paste Latin texts by more highly reputed thinkers. An example of the first type is provided by Godschalck Rosemond's *Confessionale*⁶² whereas

58. Antonino of Florence, *Summa de confession llamada Defecerunt*, Burgos, Friedrich Biel, 1499, fol. 2r: «E por evitar empachos a los letores, mayormente a los legos y no letrados, haveys de notar que las allegaciones y cotas del presente libro estaran todas sacadas por las margines». Cp. Antonino of Florence, *La summa de confession llamada Defecerunt*, Salamanca, Juan Giesser, 1500 ca., unnumbered folio: «por evitar empachos a los letores, specialmente a los legos y no letrados, haveys a notar que las allegaciones y cotas del latin que en presente libro estaran todas sacadas de fuera».

59. *Cento casi di coscienza. Raccolti dal r.p.f. Serafino Razzi; dell'Ordine de' predicatori, ristampati di nuovo con la giunta d'alcuni casi de' cambij, & un trattato de' censi*, Venice, Ventura de Salvador, 1586.

60. *Compendio del manuale del Navarro, composto dal rev. p.f. Paolo di Calanna ... Aggiuntovi il Compendio delle usure e de' cambij fatto da m. Girolamo Giovannini, dell'Ordine di San Domenico*, Venetia, Bernardo Basa, 1592.

61. Bernardin de Sienne, *La Petite Dyablerie autrement apellée Lesglise des mauvais dont Lucifer est le chef et les membres sont les joueurs inicques et pecheurs reprovuez*, Paris, Alain Lotrian, Denis Janot, 1528 and 1534.

62. Godschalck Rosemond, *Oefeninghen in die seven bloetstortinghen*, Delft, C.H. Lettersnijder, 1516; Godschalck Rosemond, *Confessionale sive libellus modum confitendi pulcherrime complectens*, Antwerp, Michaellem H. Hoochstratanum, 1518.

Jacopo Mazza's *Lucerna confessionis*⁶³ well exemplifies the second one (Langholm 2003: 98, 200-201).

The increasing use of vernacular to conceptualize economic matters is revealing of how partial is our understanding of this body of literature. It clearly calls for a deeper study of what happens when Latin terms, considered as crucial in the development of economic ideas, are relocated in a different linguistic context. Do keywords like *usura*, *pretium*, *bonum commune*, *interesse* acquire new meanings when translated in Italian, English, Castilian or French? Do they lose their legal and religious medieval rooting in favor of a simplified, but more usable and common sense meaning? And lastly, to what extent did changes related to language translation pave the way to later conceptions of economy? These questions go beyond the aims of this article but clearly need to be considered. A preliminary indication comes from the Spanish translations of Antonino of Florence seen above, which willingly marginalized their juridical references in favor of a lesser educated audience. While this choice made it easier for some to grasp the basics, it clearly eradicated from the text a backbone element, altering the deep sense that references to a centuries-long canon law tradition provided. This case shows that, exploring vernacular writings, the economic concepts they contain, and the reasons why they were made, can improve our understanding of how ordinary people learned new ways to approach their decisions in the spheres of economy and finance.

8. CODA: THE RECEPTION AND REWORKING OF MORAL ECONOMY

This article suggests a change of perspective in the study of late medieval and early modern theorization of the economy. Recent scholarship has eventually provided an approach capable of going beyond an evolutionary reconstruction of economic thought, centered on authorship and the thinking of single authors, which identified this time period as a «primitive cradle», where modern and scientific ideas were hinted at. Exploring how an economic language and economic ideas came into being over a centuries-long period of time, as well as how they were molded by an intellectual process that crossed disciplines and cultural traditions, allows to put this study in a proper historical context. I believe that our understanding would greatly increase by adding to this framework the subject of reception, transmission and reworking of these economic vocabularies and conceptualizations.

I provided an extensive outline regarding which material could allow to tackle the issue from this broader point of view, showing that a large body of sources can be usefully exploited to address it from a bottom-up perspective. Focusing on minor

63. Iacobo Maza, *Tractatu preclarissimo et utile nominato Lucerna confessionis*, Naples, [no publisher], 1519.

unedited writings, on one side, and on vernacular texts and translations, on the other, reveals that economic literature was conveyed through a process that actively involved those who used these texts. Manuscripts often provide the remnants of an intense work carried out on them, made of marginal annotations, cross-references, table of contents, diagrams and graphs. They also witness that transcription went along with a selection of what to copy and how to do it, giving birth to thematic collections that prove intellectual awareness of those who were in charge of making these assemblages. This distinctive feature of handwritten sources is shared with vernacular writings, revealing that both adopted an interactive approach when it came to transmitting existing texts (Burke and Hsia, 2007: 3). A further confirmation of the existing connections between the two types of materials is provided by the abundance, both in translations and in manuscripts, of abridgments and summaries.

These forms of textual interaction have been since long explored by scholars of in intellectual history (Acheson, 2019; Coolahan, 2020) providing a sound methodological framework that can be transferred to study the reception of economic concepts. This latter field of research points out, in particular, to the role of cultural intermediation played by copyists, translators, adaptors, as well as those who inspired and designed thematic anthologies. The holding of the convents and monasteries of the Venetian region show that in the 15th century the «classics» economic text of academic scholasticism are seldom at hand, while adaptations, reductions and assemblages prevail. A trend that is visible as well for 16th century published materials, where the increased availability of «bestsellers» on economic topics, goes along with a significant presence of books that are the result of selective translations and abridgements. What are the implications of these dynamics on the way the economy was understood? What does it mean to acknowledge that, rather than reading the complete works of some renowned theologian, monks, friars, and clergymen were trained in economic matters by a mix of simplified texts, whose authorship tended to be negligible? Keeping in mind that day-to-day business and finance were in that same period of time becoming increasingly articulated and technically complex matters, I think that this process of cultural intermediation resulted in the popularizing of the economy. It was a dynamic that, under many circumstances, is comparable to what was occurring when preachers delivered their sermons in the city squares, or the clergy was performing its duty in the confessionals. Trivializing the vocabularies and ideas that sedimented over the centuries, while certainly did not weakened their juridical and theological rooting in the mind of theologians and confessors, it unintentionally ended up doing so in the eyes of their public, perhaps loosing part of their embedded meanings.

A further element this perspective suggests is that is worth investigating about authorship. Library holdings include few writings authored by those who held the chairs of theology at the Universities of Paris or Oxford, but a constant reference to

their authority and ideas emerges when considering printed and handwritten abridgements. They acknowledge, a significant reference to the two 15th-century eminent «economists» Bernardino of Siena and Antonino of Florence, but their presence often does not coincide with their major text. Rather, they are transcribed in form of excerpts that are mingled with minor works of local nature, as well as in vernacular versions that select and adapt what to translate. Once again, it makes sense asking ourselves the reason why major scholastic authors are seldom transmitted in ways that would allow readers to fully appreciate their thinking? I have the impression that authorship was a smokescreen used as a tool to legitimize heavily reworked versions, thematic collections in their entirety, or even compositions written by minor thinkers, who in this way were able to put forward their personal views in an authoritative manner. It is a mechanism that echoes the strategies adopted by public preaching, when theologians displayed to the audience writings and books by some celebrated thinker to make their point more convincing.

A last consideration involves the interplay between ideas and their physical rooting. As we have seen, anonymous compositions, minor writings, adaptations and selective anthologies often reveal a strong connection with the local economy. Manuscripts may thus include discussions on business tools specific of a geographical area, which are not in use elsewhere. However, codices do not always remain confined where they were first written, they can circulate, bringing locally-based discussions to places quite distant from their original setting. For example, the thematic collection designed by Niccolò Grassetti, travelled from Padua, to Lombardy and nowadays Switzerland, eventually ending in libraries that are in current Netherlands and the Czech Republic. In a minor way, displacement might concern vernacular editions as well. As revealed by the survey carried out on the RICCI database, among the holdings of Italian 16th century convents there are several books written in Castilian. Is there perhaps an indirect and unexpected consequence of this circulation? Are there any conceptual implications due to the detaching of a locally confined discussion from its economic background? One consequence could be supportive of conceptualizations abstracting from specific cases general rules. Yet, when reading these compositions, the impression one gets is that of being very distant from a way of reasoning aiming at discovering some abstract and universal laws of economics. Rather than being the result of a rationalization, evolving ideas from one brilliant intellectual to another, they recall a series of collective precepts to follow.

REFERENCES

- Acheson, K. O. (2013). *Visual Rhetoric and Early Modern English Literature*. Farnham: Ashgate.
- Acheson, K. O. (2019), Introduction: Marginalia, Reading, and Writing. In K. O. Acheson (ed.), *Early Modern English Marginalia*. London-New York: Routledge.

- Amadori, S. (2007). *Nelle bisacce di Bernardino da Feltre. Gli scritti in difesa dei Monti di Pietà*. Bologna: Editrice compositori.
- Ammannati, A. (2014), The Astudillo Partnership and the Spanish «Nation» in Sixteenth-century Florence, in A. Caracausi and C. Jeggle (eds.), *Commercial Networks and European Cities, 1400-1800*. London: Pickering & Chatto.
- Arquero Caballero, G. F. (2014/15). Si dio a usura pública o secretamente: aproximación a la usura en los manuales de confesores de la Castilla bajomedieval, *Baética: Estudios de Historia Moderna y Contemporánea*, 36-37, 157-179.
- Armstrong, L. (1999). The Politics of Usury in Trecento Florence: The *Questio de monte* of Francesco da Empoli. *Mediaeval Studies*, 61, 1-44.
- Bacchelli, F. F. (2001). Giovanni da Prato. In *Dizionario Biografico degli Italiani*, vol. 56. Roma: Istituto dell'Enciclopedia Italiana.
- Bauer, R. & Marroquin Arredondo, J. (2019). Introduction: An Age of Translation, In J. Marroquin Arredondo, R. Bauer (eds.), *Translating Nature: Cross-Cultural Histories of Early Modern Science*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Boháček, M. (1994). *Beschreibung der mittelalterlichen Handschriften der Wissenschaftlichen Staatsbibliothek von Olmütz*, Köln: Böhlau.
- Borraccini, R. M., Granata, G., Rusconi, R. (2013). A proposito dell'inchiesta della S. Congregazione dell'Indice dei libri proibiti di fine '500, *Il Capitale culturale. Studies on the Value of Cultural Heritage*, 6, 13-45.
- Boyle, L. E. (1974). The *Summa Confessorum* of John of Freiburg and the Popularization of the Moral Teaching of St. Thomas and some of his contemporaries, in A. A. Maurer (ed.), *St. Thomas Aquinas, 1274-1974: Commemorative Studies*, vol. 2. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies.
- Burke, P. & Hsia, R. P. (2007), Introduction. In P. Burke, R. P. Hsia (eds.), *Cultural translation in early modern Europe*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Burke, P. (2007), Cultures of translation in early modern Europe. In P. Burke, R. P. Hsia (eds.), *Cultural translation in early modern Europe*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Burke, P. (2015). Translating the Language of Architecture. In K. Newman, J. Tylus (eds.), *Early Modern Cultures of Translation*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Caferro, W. (2020). Premodern European Capitalism, Christianity, and Florence. *Business History Review*, 94, 39-72.
- Capitani, O. (1958). La *venditio ad terminum* nella valutazione morale di san Tommaso d'Aquino e Remigio de' Girolami. *Bullettino dell'Istituto storico italiano per il Medioevo*, 70, 299-363.
- Casado Alonso, H. (2017). Redes mercantiles españolas entre Europa, África, Asia y América: el protagonismo del Atlántico. In A. M. Bernal, *Modernidad de España apertura europea e integración atlántica*. Bilbao, Madrid: Iberdrola España, Marcial Pons Historia.
- Ceccarelli, G. (2001). Usura e casistica creditizia nella *Summa Astesana*: un esempio di sintesi delle concezioni etico-economiche francescane. In B. Molina and G. Scarcia (eds.),

- Ideologia del credito fra Tre e Quattrocento: dall'Astesano ad Angelo da Chivasso.* Asti: Centro Studi sui Lombardi e sul credito nel Medioevo.
- Ceccarelli, G. (2006). «Whatever Economics»: Economic Thought in Quodlibeta. In C. Schabel (ed.), *Theological quodlibeta in the Middle Ages: The Thirteenth Century*. Leiden-Boston: Brill.
- Ceccarelli, G. (2012). Angelo da Chivasso. In *Il contributo italiano alla storia del pensiero. Economia*. Roma: Istituto dell'Enciclopedia Italiana, 2012.
- Ceccarelli, G. (2022). Risky Narratives: Framing General Average into Risk-management Strategies. In M. Fusaro, A. Addobbati and L. Piccinno (eds.), *Sharing Risk: General Average and European Maritime Business (VI-XVIII Centuries)*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Considine, J. (2015). Cutting and Pasting Slips: Early Modern Compilation and Information Management. *Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies*, 45(3), 487-504.
- Coolahan, M.-L. (2020). The Cultural Dynamics of Reception in Early Modern Europe. *Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies*, 50 (1), 1-12.
- Corazzol, G. (1979). Fitti e livelli a grano. Un aspetto del credito rurale nel Veneto del '500. Milano: Franco Angeli.
- Darnton, R. (1982). What Is the History of Books?. *Daedalus*, 111(3), 65-83.
- de Roover, R. (1974). *Business, Banking, and Economic Thought in Late Medieval and Early Modern Europe*. J. Kirshner (ed.), Chicago: Chicago University Press.
- Delcorno, C. (1995). The language of preachers: Between Latin and vernacular. *The Italianist*, 15(1), 48-66.
- Dini, B. (1995). Mercanti Spagnoli a Firenze (1480-1530). In B. Dini, *Saggi su una economia-mondo: Firenze e l'Italia fra Mediterraneo ed Europa, secc. 13-16*. Pisa: Pacini.
- Dorin, R. W. (2013). Canon law and the problem of expulsion: The origins and interpretation of *Usurarum voraginem* (VI 5.5.1). *Zeitschrift der Savigny-Stiftung für Rechtsgeschichte: Kanonistische Abteilung*, 99(1), 129-161.
- Dorin, R. W. (2014). L'expulsion des usuriers hors de France à la fin du XIII^e siècle. *Hypothèses*, 17 (1), 57-166.
- Durissini, D. (1994). La voce «usura» nel *Supplementum Summae Pisanellae* di Niccolò da Osimo, *Studi Medievali*, 35, 217-258.
- Evangelisti, P. (2020). Messi in forma di parola. Moneta, denari e mercato nei sermoni di Bernardino da Feltre (1493-1494). *Archivio Storico Cenedese. Studi e ricerche tra Piave e Livenza*, 5, 3-58.
- Fanfani, A. (1933). *Le origini dello spirito capitalistico in Italia*. Milano: Vita e Pensiero.
- Farge, J. K. (2008). Noël Beda and the defense of the tradition. In Erika Rummel (ed.), *Biblical Humanism and Scholasticism in the Age of Erasmus*. Leiden-Boston: Brill.
- Favero, G. (2017). A New Edition of Benedetto's Cotrugli The Book of the Art of Trade. In B. Cotrugli, *The Book of the Art of Trade*. London: Palgrave Macmillan 2017.
- García y García, A., Cantelar Rodríguez, F., & Alonso Rodríguez, B. (1992), Libro de las confesiones de Martín Pérez, *Revista Española de Derecho Canónico*, 49, 77-129.
- Giansante, M. (2008), *L'usuraio onorato: credito e potere a Bologna in età comunale*. Bologna: Il Mulino.

- Grossi, P. (1966). Somme penitenziali, diritto canonico, diritto comune. *Annali della Facoltà giuridica di Macerata*, n. s., 1, 95-134.
- Henquinet, F. M. (1939). Clair de Florence, canoniste et pénitencier pontifical vers le milieu du XIII^e siècle. *Archivum Franciscanum historicum*, 32, 3-48.
- Hernando Delgado, J. (1989). Quaestio disputata de licitudine contractus emptiois et venditionis censualis cum conditione revenditionis. Tratado sobre la licitud del contracto de compravenda de rentas personales y redimibles. Bernat de Puigcercós, O. P. (siglo XIV), *Acta Historica et Archaeologica Mediaevalia*, 10, 9-87.
- Hernando Delgado, J. (1990-1991). Un tratado sobre la licitud del contrato de compraventa de rentas vitalicias y redimibles ('violaris'). Allegationes iure factae super venditionibus violariorum cum instrumento gratiae. Ramon Saera (siglo XIV), *Acta Historica et Archaeologica Mediaevalia*, 11-12, 9-74.
- Hernando Delgado, J. (2015). «El tractat sobre la usura», Francesc Eiximenis (c. 1330-1409): el context i l'obra d'un gran pensador català medieval. In Antoni Riera i Melis (ed.), *Actes de les jornades celebrades a Barcelona els dies 16 i 17 de desembre de 2009*. Barcelona: Institut d'estudis Catalans.
- Humphreys, K. W. (1966). *The Library of the Franciscans of the Convent of St. Antony, Padua at the Beginning of the Fifteenth Century*. Amsterdam: Erasmus.
- Izbicki, T. M. (1983). Legal and Polemical Manuscripts, 1100-1500, in Biblioteca Ambrosiana, Milano, *Quaderni catanesi di studi classici e medievali*, 5, 147-176.
- Izbicki, T. M. (1989). Pyres of vanities. Mendicant preaching on the vanity of women and its lay audience. In Th. L. Amos (ed.), *De ore Domini: Preacher and Word in the Middle Ages*. Kalamazoo: Medieval Institute Publications.
- Izbicki, T. M. (2004). The Origins of the *De ornatu mulierum* of Antoninus of Florence, in *Modern Language Notes*, 119(1), 142-161.
- Jardine, L. & Grafton, A. (1990). 'Studied for Action:' How Gabriel Harvey Read His Livy. *Past and Present*, 129, 30-78.
- Kaye, K. (1998). *Economy and Nature in the Fourteenth Century: Money, Market Exchange, and the Emergence of Scientific Thought*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Kaye, K. (2014). *A History of Balance, 1250-1375: The Emergence of a New Model of Equilibrium and its Impact on Thought*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Kirshner, J. (1977). The Moral Problem of Discounting Genoese «Paghe». *Archivum Fratrum Praedicatorum*, 47, 109-154.
- Kirshner, Julius e Lo Prete, Kimberly (1984). *Peter John Olivi's Treatises on Contracts of Sale, Usury and Restitution: Minorite Economics or Minor Works?*, *Quaderni fiorentini*, 13, 233-286.
- Lambertini, R. (2020a). L'usura tra Santa Croce e Santa Maria Novella: Pietro de *Trabibus* e Remigio de' Girolami a confronto. In *Vedere nell'ombra. Studi su natura, spiritualità e scienze operative offerti a Michela Pereira*. Firenze: SISMELE-Edizioni del Galluzzo.
- Lambertini, R. (2020b). I Monti empì. Osservazioni su di un dibattito. In P. Delcorno and I. Zavattoni (eds.), *Credito e Monti di Pietà tra medioevo e età moderna: un bilancio storiografico*. Bologna: Il Mulino.

- Lane, F. C. (1966). Investment and Usury. In F.C. Lane, *Venice and History: Collected Papers*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Langholm, O. (1992). *Economics in the Medieval Schools. Wealth, Exchange, Value, Money and Usury, according to the Paris Theological Tradition. 1200-1350*. Leiden-Boston: Brill.
- Langholm, O. (2003). *The Merchant in the Confessional: Trade and Price in the Pre-Reformation Penitential Handbooks*. Leiden-Boston: Brill.
- Le Goff, J. (1960). Au Moyen Âge: Temps de l'Église et temps du marchand. *Annales. Histoire, Sciences Sociales*, 15(3), 417-433.
- Lenoble, C. (2013). *L'exercice de la pauvreté. Economie et religion chez les franciscains d'Avignon (XIII^e-XV^e siècles)*, Rennes: Presses Universitaires de Rennes.
- Mayne Kienzle, B. (2002). Medieval Sermons and their Performance: Theory and Record. In C. Muessig (ed.), *Preacher, Sermon and Audience in the Middle Ages*. Leiden-Boston: Brill.
- Meneghin, V. (1993). *Il convento di S. Spirito di Feltre e la sua biblioteca*, Venezia: Tipografia LIEF.
- Melchiorre, M. (2012). *A un cenno del suo dito: Fra Bernardino da Feltre (1439-1494) e gli ebrei*, Milano: Unicopli.
- Michaud-Quantin, P. (1962). *Sommes de casuistique et manuels de confession au moyen-âge (XII-XVI siècles)*. Louvain-Lille-Montréal: Nauwelaerts.
- Mueller, R. C. (1997). *The Venitian Money Market: Banks, Panics, and the Public Debt, 1200-1500*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Muessig, C. (2002). Audience and Preacher: *ad Status* Sermons and Social Classification. In C. Muessig (ed.), *Preacher, Sermon and Audience in the Middle Ages*. Leiden-Boston: Brill.
- Munro, J. H. (2003). The Medieval Origins of the Financial Revolution: Usury, Rentes, and Negotiability, *The International History Review*, 25, 505-562.
- Murano, G. (2016). Alessandro Nievo (1417-1484). In Giovanna Murano (ed.) *Autographa I/2: Giuristi, giudici e notai (sec. XII-XV)*. Imola: La Mandragora.
- Muzzarelli, M. G. (2000). *Il denaro e la salvezza: l'invenzione del Monte di Pietà*. Bologna: Il Mulino.
- Muzzarelli, M. G. (2005). *Pescatori di uomini. Predicatori e piazze alla fine del Medioevo*. Bologna: Il Mulino.
- Newman, I., Tylus, J. (2015). Introduction. In K. Newman, J. Tylus (eds.), *Early Modern Cultures of Translation*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Noonan, J. T. (1957). *The Scholastic Analysis of Usury*, Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.
- Pantarotto, M. (2003). *La biblioteca manoscritta del convento di S. Francesco Grande di Padova. Padova*: Centro Studi Antoniani.
- Patton, E. (2019). Praying in the Margins across the Reformation: Readers' Marks in Early Tudor Books of Hours. In K. O. Acheson (ed.), *Early Modern English Marginalia*. London-New York: Routledge.

- Piana, C. (1982), L'evoluzione degli studi nell'Osservanza francescana nella prima metà del '400 e la polemica tra Guarino da Verona e fra Giovanni da Prato a Ferrara (1450), *Analecta Pomposiana*, 7, 249-289.
- Piketty, T. (2017). Introduction. In G. Todeschini, *Les Marchands et le Temple. La société chrétienne et le cercle vertueux de la richesse du Moyen-Âge à l'Epoque moderne*. Paris: Albin Michel.
- Piketty, T. (2020). *Capital and Ideology*. Cambridge Mass.: Harvard University Press.
- Puchades i Battaller, R. J. (1999). *Als ulls de Déu, als ulls dels homes. Estereotips morals i percepció social d'algunes figures professionals en la societat medieval valenciana*. València: Universitat de València.
- Ridolfi, R. M. (2001), Girolamo Giovannini. In *Dizionario Biografico degli Italiani*, vol. 56. Roma: Istituto dell'Enciclopedia Italiana.
- Rigon, A. (2002). Frati Minori, inquisizione e comune di Padova nel secondo Duecento. In E. Bonato (ed.), *Il «Liber contractuum» dei frati Minori di Padova e di Vicenza (1263-1302)*. Roma: Viella.
- Sangster, A. (2020). Accounting Education and Ethics in the 15th Century. In M. M. Pinheiro, A. J. Costa (eds.), *Accounting Ethics Education: Teaching Virtues and Values*. London-New York: Routledge.
- Schumpeter, J. A. (1952). *History of economic analysis*. London: Allen & Unwin.
- Sherman, W. (2008). *Used Books: Marking Readers in Renaissance England*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Spicciani, A. (1976). *Gli scritti sul capitale e sull'interesse di fra Pietro di Giovanni Olivi. Fonti per la storia del pensiero economico medievale, Studi Francescani*, 73, 289-316.
- Todeschini, G. (1980). *Un trattato di economia politica francescana: il «De emptionibus et venditionibus, de usuris, de restitutionibus» di Pietro di Giovanni Olivi*. Roma: Istituto Storico per il Medio Evo.
- Todeschini, G. (2002). *I mercanti e il Tempio. La società cristiana e il circolo virtuoso della ricchezza fra Medioevo ed Età Moderna*. Bologna: Il Mulino.
- Todeschini, G. (2004). *Ricchezza francescana. Dalla povertà volontaria alla società di mercato*. Bologna: Il Mulino.
- Todeschini, G. (2017). *Les Marchands et le Temple. La société chrétienne et le cercle vertueux de la richesse du Moyen-Âge à l'Epoque moderne*. Paris: Albin Michel.
- Todeschini, G. (2021). *Come l'acqua e il sangue. Le origini medievali del pensiero economico*. Roma: Laterza.
- Toneatto, V. (2012). *Les Banquiers du Seigneur: Evêques et moines face à la richesse (IV^e-début IX^e siècle)*. Rennes: Presses universitaires de Rennes.
- Trivellato, F. (2019). *The Promise and Peril of Credit: What a Forgotten Legend about Jews and Finance Tells Us about the Making of European Commercial Society*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Tucci, U. (1990). Introduction. In B. Cotrugli, *Il libro dell'arte di mercatura*. Venice: Techné.
- Ughetti, L. (2020). La *reportatio* come fonte economica. Proposte di lettura dell'economia francescana attraverso le prediche di Bernardino da Siena, *Studi medievali*, 3rd s., 61(2), 667-687.

- Veraja, F. (1960). *Le origini della controversia teologica sul contratto di censo nel xiii secolo*. Roma: Edizioni di storia e letteratura.
- Visnjevac, S. (2018). Law as the Sermon: The «Sermones quadragesimales de legibus» of Leonardo Mattei da Udine (c. 1399-1469). In L. Gaffuri and R. M. Parrinello (eds.), *Verbum e ius: predicazione e sistemi giuridici nell'Occidente medievale. Preaching and legal frameworks in the Middle Ages*. Firenze: Firenze University Press.
- Ziegler, G. (2019). Lady Anne Clifford Reads John Selden. In K. O. Acheson (ed.), *Early Modern English Marginalia*. London-New York: Routledge.